



12th MEETING OF THE SCIENTIFIC COMMITTEE

Lima, Peru, 30 September – 05 October 2024

SC 12 – WP 04



**PROPOSAL FOR THE WORKSHOP ON READING OTOLITHS OF
JACK MACKEREL (TRACHURUS MURPHYI) BETWEEN AGE
AND GROWTH LABORATORIES OF THE SPRFMO**

TERMS OF REFERENCE DOCUMENT - IMARPE

Submitted by

Instituto del Mar del Perú

IMARPE

2024

**PROPOSAL FOR THE WORKSHOP ON READING OTOLITHS OF JACK
MACKEREL (*TRACHURUS MURPHYI*) BETWEEN AGE AND GROWTH
LABORATORIES OF THE SPRFMO**

TERMS OF REFERENCE DOCUMENT - IMARPE

SUMMARY

Growth parameter estimates of jack mackerel (*Trachurus murphyi*) from otolith age readings are essential to understand and characterize the population in the context of SPRFMO. Despite the multiple studies carried out to obtain more accurate results on age and growth, there is still no consensus among SPRFMO members on the results obtained to date. In the last meetings of the Scientific Committee (SC), it has been proposed to address this issue through joint workshops on age readings between the organization's laboratories. In this regard, the Chilean delegation is proposing to hold an otolith reading workshop (SC12_JM09) in the context of the 12th SPRFMO-2024 SC meeting. This initiative contemplates the direct reading of processed samples, using images obtained through methodologies and techniques that have not yet been agreed upon by all laboratories involved in age and growth assessment. In this regard, the Peruvian delegation expresses its commitment to make the necessary efforts to address this problem and is willing to carry out joint work with all members of the SPRFMO. It considers it essential to address this situation in an orderly and phased manner, with a short- and medium-term focus, as detailed in this document.

I. Background

The jack mackerel *Trachurus murphyi* Nichols 1920 is widely distributed in the southeastern Pacific, extending to the westernmost Pacific Ocean, reaching the coasts of New Zealand and Australia (Evseenko, 1987; Serra, 1991; Elizarov et al., 1993; Gerlotto and Diones, 2013). Since 2013, within the SPRFMO SC, several discussions have been held on the estimation of growth parameters to obtain commonly accepted estimates (SPRFMO 2013, 2022). For example, efforts have been made to determine age and estimate growth parameters of jack mackerel, mainly based on whole otolith readings. Given the differences observed in the results so far and the need to understand biological parameters within the framework of stock population discussions (SPRFMO, 2008), validation studies of the first growth marks at the microincrement level in jack mackerel otoliths have been carried out, and these have been discussed since the first SC meeting (SPRFMO, 2013, 2023). However, consensus has not yet been reached, and several criteria or approaches continue to be applied in the interpretation of microincrements in the validation processes, as well as the assumption of annual growth marks.

Despite the considerable efforts made to accurately determine the age of jack mackerel, the results are not entirely clear, and errors in age estimation may lead to errors in the estimation of stock catch and weight at age, maturity at age, and any catch-per-unit-effort (CPUE) index structured by age, which would affect virtually all evaluation inputs (Reeves, 2003). Therefore, at the recent SC meetings, the need to address this issue

has been emphasized by organizing age reading workshops. In the context of the 12th SPRFMO SC meeting in 2024, Chile is proposing to hold an otolith reading workshop with the objective of “Proposal of terms of reference for the Jack mackerel (*Trachurus murphyi*) otolith reading workshop between SPRFMO ageing laboratories” (SC12_JM09).

This proposal suggests conducting direct readings of processed samples based on images obtained using methodologies and techniques that have not yet been agreed upon by all age and growth laboratories within the organization. These methodologies include readings of whole otoliths in the sagittal plane, age analysis based on images, and readings in transverse sections. In this regard, studies carried out to date on jack mackerel age and growth (Table 1) have identified two main issues related to age validation and assignment. The first concerns the methodological approach, encompassing both otolith processing and the assignment of growth marks in the sagittal plane; this affects both the validation of the first annuli through microstructures and the reading of annual marks in whole otoliths. The second issue relates to the sampling design, which must consider the size structure throughout its distribution and the sample size in the estimates.

In the validation processes of the first annulus, the method of readings in the sagittal plane of the otolith has predominated. However, this approach presents some uncertainty in its results due to factors related to sample processing, the tools used, and interpretation. Firstly, the interpretations of the growth marks are susceptible to issues such as over-polishing, the incidence of light from the optical microscope, contrast adjustment, microscope resolution, and the observation of “visual artifacts” (Campana, 1992). Additionally, the angle of processing and observation of the sample in the sagittal plane also influences the results (Panfili et al., 2002).

This issue has been evident in almost all validation studies using microstructures (Goicochea et al., 2013; Goicochea et al., 2016; Cerna et al., 2016; Araya et al., 2019; Cerna et al., 2022). Regarding interpretation, a criterion established by Cermeño et al. (2008) has been followed to assign daily growth marks to structures that could be an unfortunate product of processing and visualization effects under an optical microscope, referred to as individual marks or band groups. Furthermore, readings of annual marks in the same sagittal plane also present limitations; they are not recommended for otoliths of older fish, as the growth pattern in older fish changes, becoming indistinguishable in many cases, which may lead to underestimation of age.

Regarding validation using radiocarbon, which was presented at the last SPRFMO SC meeting, some uncertainty in the results is noted. Cerna et al. (2022) presented an update of the growth model for Chilean jack mackerel based on the 2016 results as the “right” ones; however, the estimates show some bias in the determination of the first two hyaline marks. Radiocarbon 14 varies in a non-uniform latitudinal manner in the Pacific Ocean (Broecker et al., 1985), making it inadvisable to use the radiocarbon 14 assimilation model of *Hippoglossus hippoglossus* (used to normalize ^{14}C) as a reference for jack mackerel, as both species are ecologically distinct (demersal and pelagic, respectively) and from opposite latitudes, and ^{14}C assimilation in fish occurs through diet (Campana, 1999), so prey selectivity is a key factor to consider in these studies. Moreover, the average lifespan of ^{14}C in the environment is 5700 years, with very low sensitivity and uncertainty levels of ± 30 years (Hajdas et al., 2021), which does not help when dealing with relatively short-lived organisms where a few years are under discussion. Therefore, it would be more appropriate to use another isotope with a shorter lifespan.

Regarding sampling design, it is crucial to analyze the size structure across the entire distribution area for estimating growth parameters. The stock in the Southeast Pacific is primarily composed of individuals smaller than 45 cm TL (Gerlotto and Dioses, 2013), while in western waters, the size structure is larger, exceeding 50 cm FL, and has been increasing in landings on the coasts of New Zealand over recent years (Horn et al., 2019). Horn and Maolagáin (2020) suggest that the population in areas of the Southeast Pacific comprises the smallest sizes, corresponding to the youngest groups. However, the size structure of jack mackerel is not entirely clear, which could affect the estimated growth parameters for the Southeast Pacific population, depending on the structures used. Additionally, in the validation processes of the annuli, the necessary size range for accurate estimation has not been adequately covered (Goicochea et al., 2013; Goicochea et al., 2016; Araya et al., 2019; Cerna et al., 2022).

In this context, it is crucial to unify the criteria for determining the age of jack mackerel, with the goal of obtaining accurate biological parameters that allow for proper characterization of population units and improving their management and conservation. This could be achieved through consensus-based initiatives in an otolith reading workshop, where the issue is addressed by reviewing previous studies, evaluating methods and techniques in the validation process, and establishing a reading protocol.

Regarding document SC12_JM09 presented by the Chilean delegation, the Peruvian delegation expresses its commitment to make the necessary efforts to address this issue and is willing to carry out joint work with all SPRFMO members. From our perspective, it is essential to approach this situation in an orderly manner and in stages, with a short- and medium-term focus, as detailed in this document.

We recommend that Dr. Jacques Panfili, a French specialist from IRD - UMR MARBEC and the Federal Rural University of Pernambuco in Brazil, who has been working on this issue, accompany this process.

II. Workshop Objectives

The objective of the workshop is to establish the interpretation criteria for growth marks in *Trachurus murphyi* otoliths used for age determination by the age and growth laboratories of the SPRFMO member countries, which will be reflected in an age reading protocol for otoliths. Therefore, the workshop aims to:

- a. Analyze the methods and validation processes of annuli using microincrements.
- b. Standardize the criteria for interpreting growth marks in otoliths.
- c. Obtain a consensus-based protocol for reading age in *Trachurus murphyi* otoliths.

III. Workshop Organization

The workshop will be conducted in three stages, either virtually and/or in person (Table 1), as appropriate:

A. Analysis of validation through microstructures: In this first stage, the approach, methods, and criteria used in the validation process and the assignment of age in macro rings will be analyzed. This will allow us to identify and assess the main problems associated with age validation. This stage will be conducted virtually and should establish:

1. A review and analysis of the dating methods or techniques in jack mackerel, as well as a review of the validation of jack mackerel age.

V. Workshop report and documents

A report will be drafted with the agreements from each stage. At the end, a unified protocol for age assignment in jack mackerel *T. murphyi* must be developed in collaboration with the members of the SPRFMO.

VI. Annex

Table 1: Studies on age and growth of jack mackerel *T. murphyi* conducted by several authors, updated from Dioses et al. (2013) and Cerna et al. (2016).

N°	Authors	Structure	Method	Loo	k	to	Area
1	Kaiser (1973)	Otolith	Sagital section	70,1	0,184	-0,341	Northern - Central Chile
2	Carrera et al. (1978)	Otolith	Sagital section	108,3	0,109	-0,877	Central Chile
3	Abramov & Kotlyar (1980)	Otolith	Sagital section	72,5	0,093	-2,233	Peru
4	Aguayo & Ojeda (1981)	Otolith	Sagital section	45,9	0,167	-0,882	Northern Chile
5	Nekrasov (1982)	Scale	Whole section	74,3	0,086	-2,676	Peru
6	Shevchuk (1982)	Otolith	Sagital section	90,4	0,115	-1,429	Peru - Chile
7	Castillo & Arrizaga (1987)	Otolith	Sagital section	65,2	0,074	-2,410	Southern Chile
8	Nekrasov (1987)	Scale	Whole section	96,0	0,060	-2,617	Peru
9	Nosov (1989)	Scale	Whole section	77,8	0,077	-1,613	Peru
10	Kochkin (1994)	Otolith	Sagital section	74,2	0,111	-0,811	Peru
11	Shcherbitch (1991)	Otolith	Sagital section	91,2	0,091	-1,583	--
12	Babayán & Bulgakova (1994)	Length	LFA	94,5	0,099	--	South Pacific
13	Alegria et al. (1995)	Otolith	Sagital section	78,5	0,154	-0,098	Northern Chile
14	Alegria et al. (1995)	Otolith	Sagital section	53,5	0,111	-1,797	Northern Chile
15	Alegria et al. (1995)	Otolith	Transerse section	48,4	0,184	-0,945	Northern Chile
16	Arcos & Arancibia (1995)	Otolith	Sagital section	79,9	0,068	-2,369	Central - Southern Chile
17	Arcos & Arancibia (1995)	Otolith	Transerse section	70,7	0,088	-2,107	Central - Southern Chile
18	Cubillos & Grechina (1998)	Length	LFA	78,6	0,144	--	Chile
19	Li et al. (2011)	Otolith	Sagital section	73,8	0,107	-1,080	Central - Southern Chile
20	Dioses (2013)	Otolith	Sagital section	80,8	0,155	-0,356	Peru
21	Díaz (2013)	Length	LFA	81,6	0,167	--	Peru
22	Goicochea et al. (2013)*	Otolith	Sagital section	75,2	0,165	-0,817	Peru
22	Cerna et al. (2016)*	Otolith	Sagital section				Chile
23	Cerna et al. (2016)*	Otolith	Bomb Radiocarbon				Chile
24	Goicochea et al 2016*	Otolith	Sagital section				Peru
25	Goicochea et al 2016*	Otolith	Transerse section				Peru
26	Cisterna & Arancibia (2017)	Otolith	Sagital section	75,0	0,160	-0,130	Central Chile
27	Araya et al 2019*	Otolith	Sagital section				Chile
28	Horn & Maolagáin (2020)	Otolith	Transerse section	51,9	0,223	-0,500	New Zealand
29	Arancibia et al. (2021)	Otolith	Daily ring	75,0	0,160	-0,190	Peru - Chile
30	Arancibia et al. (2021)	Otolith	Sagital section	74,7	0,100	-0,500	Peru - Chile
31	Cerna et al. (2022)*	Otolith	Sagital section				Chile
32	Cerna et al. (2023)	Otolith	Annual ring	64,9	0,130	-2,630	Chile
33	Cerna et al. (2023)	Otolith	Transerse section	56,9	0,170	-2,330	Chile

* Age validation studies

VII. References

- Alegría, V., Oliva, J., Robotham, H., Miranda, H., Bohm, G., Caballero, L., Bore, D., et al. (1995). Estudio biológico pesquero sobre el recurso jurel en la zona norte de Chile (Regiones I y II). Informe Final, Proyecto FIP, 93–18.
- Arancibia, H., Cisterna, L., & Sepúlveda, A. (2021). Individual growth in jack mackerel (*Trachurus murphyi*) of the Southeastern Pacific Ocean using sagitta otolith weight, daily rings, and annual rings. *Gayana*, 85(1), 95–102. <https://doi.org/10.4067/S0717-652X2021000100095>
- Araya, M., Medina M., Segovia E., Peñailillo, J., Avilés M., Guissen, K., Arcos, A., Charlin J., Pacheco C., Plaza G., Galeano A.M., Contreras J., Rodríguez C., Cisterna L., Sepúlveda A., Neira M. & Sanhueza E. (2019). Validación de la formación de los Anillos de Crecimiento Diario de Jurel. Proyecto FIPA N° 2017-61. Fondo de Investigación Pesquera y de Acuicultura.
- Babayan, V. K., & Bulgakova, T. I. (1994). Estimation of jack mackerel stock in the southeastern Pacific based on size composition analysis of catches. In *Biología y pesca comercial del jurel en el Pacífico Sur* (pp. 147–155).
- Broecker, Wallace S, Tsung-Hung Peng, Gote Ostlund, and Minze Stuiver. (1985). "The Distribution of Bomb Radiocarbon in the Ocean." *Journal of Geophysical Research: Oceans* 90 (C4): 6953–70.
- Campana, S. E. (1999). "Chemistry and Composition of Fish Otoliths: Pathways, Mechanisms and Applications." *Marine Ecology Progress Series* 188: 263–97.
- Campana, S.E. & Jones, C. M. (1992). Analysis of otolith microstructure data. P. 73-100. In: D.K. Stevenson and S.E. Campana [eds]. *Otolith microstructure examination and analysis*. Can. Spec. Publ. Fish. Aquat. Sci. 117.
- Carrera, P. P., Saa Collantes, E., Méndez Zamorano, R., & Yany, G. G. (1978). Determinación de edad y crecimiento del jurel *Trachurus murphyi* Nichols, 1920. Universidad Católica de Valparaíso, Centro de Investigaciones del Mar.
- Castillo, G., & Arrizaga, A. (1987). Edad y crecimiento del jurel *Trachurus symmetricus murphyi* (Nichols, 1920) en aguas de Chile central. *Biología Pesquera*, 16, 19–33.
- Cermeño, P., Uriarte, A., Morales-Nin, B., Cotano, U., & Álvarez, P. (2008). Setting up interpretation criteria for ageing juvenile European anchovy otoliths. *Scientia Marina*, 72(4), 733–742. <https://doi.org/10.3989/scimar.2008.72n4733>
- Cerna, F., Moyano, G., Valero, C., Muñoz, L., Plaza, G., & Campana, S. E. (2022). Bomb radiocarbon, otolith daily increments, and length modes validate age interpretations of Chilean jack mackerel (*Trachurus murphyi*). *Frontiers in Marine Science*, 9, 906583. <https://doi.org/10.3389/fmars.2022.906583>
- Cerna, F., Valero, C., Moyano, G., & Muñoz, L. (2016). Protocolo de lectura de otolitos de jurel. IFOP. <https://www.subpesca.cl/fipa/613/w3-article-89390.html>
- Cisterna, L., & Arancibia, H. (2017). Age of jack mackerel *Trachurus murphyi* (Carangidae) using daily growth rings in sagittae otoliths. *Gayana*, 81(1), 28. <https://doi.org/10.4067/S0717-652X2017000100028>
- Cubillos, L., & Grechina, A. S. (1998). Crecimiento del jurel *Trachurus symmetricus murphyi* (Nichols) del Pacífico suroriental mediante análisis de progresión modal. In *Biología y ecología del jurel en aguas chilenas* (pp. 151–161). Instituto de Investigación Pesquera.
- Díaz, E. (2013). Estimación del crecimiento del jurel *Trachurus murphyi* capturado en el Perú, a partir del análisis de las frecuencias por tallas. *Revista Peruana de Biología*, 20(1), 053–060. <https://doi.org/10.15381/rpb.v20i1.7651>
- Dioses, T. (2013). Edad y crecimiento del jurel *Trachurus murphyi* en el Perú. *Revista Peruana de Biología*, 20(1), 045–052. <https://doi.org/10.15381/rpb.v20i1.7650>
- Dioses, T., Goicochea, C., Guevara-Carrasco, R., & Csirke, J. (2013). Proposing an integrated approach for tackling the uncertainties in the ageing and estimation of growth parameters of jack mackerel (*Trachurus*

murphyi) in the South Pacific. Paper SC-01-19 presented at the South Pacific Regional Fisheries Management Organization, Scientific Committee Meeting, La Jolla, California, USA, 21–27 October 2013.

Elizarov, A. A., Grechina, A. S., Kotenev, B. N., & Kuzetsov, A. N. (1993). Peruvian jack mackerel, *Trachurus symmetricus murphyi*, in the open waters of the South Pacific. *Journal of Ichthyology*, 33(3), 86–104. <https://doi.org/10.1007/BF00822081>

Evseenko, S.A. (1987). Reproduction of the Peruvian jack mackerel *Trachurus symmetricus murphyi* in the South Pacific. *Journal of Ichthyology* 27: 151–160.

Gerlotto, F., & Diones, T. (2013). Bibliographical synopsis on the main traits of life of *Trachurus murphyi* in the South Pacific Ocean. In The First Meeting of the Scientific Committee of SPRFMO.

Goicochea, C., Diones, T., & Csirke, J. (2016). Analysis of the microincrements and the formation of the first annual ring in otoliths of jack mackerel (*Trachurus murphyi*) from Chile and Peru through the individual mark reading (IMR) and the group band reading (GBR), with observations on the periodicity of the growth ring.

Goicochea, C., Mostacero, J., Moquillaza, P., Diones, T., Topiño, Y., & Guevara-Carrasco, R. (2013). Validación del ritmo de formación de los anillos de crecimiento en otolitos del jurel *Trachurus murphyi* Nichols, 1920. *Revista Peruana de Biología*, 20(1), 053–060. <https://doi.org/10.15381/rpb.v20i1.7651>

Hajdas, I., Ascough, P., Garnett, M. H., Fallon, S. J., Pearson, C. L., Quarta, G., ... & Yoneda, M. (2021). Radiocarbon dating. *Nature Reviews Methods Primers*, 1(1), 62.

Horn, P. L., Maolagáin, C. Ó., & Hulston, D. (2019). Commercial catch sampling for species proportion, sex, length, and age of jack mackerels in JMA 7 in the 2017–18 fishing year, with a summary of all available data sets. *New Zealand Fisheries Assessment Report*, 43, 28.

Horn, P., & Maolagáin, C. (2020). The growth and age structure of Chilean jack mackerel (*Trachurus murphyi*) following its influx to New Zealand waters. *Journal of Fish Biology*, 98(4), 1144–1154. <https://doi.org/10.1111/jfb.14647>

Kaiser, C. E. (1973). Age and growth of horse mackerel *Trachurus murphyi* off Chile. *Transactions of the American Fisheries Society*, 102(3), 591–595.

Kochkin, P. N. (1994). Age determination and estimate of growth rate for the Peruvian jack mackerel, *Trachurus symmetricus murphyi*. *Journal of Ichthyology/Voprosy Ikhtiologii*, 34, 6.

Li, G., Zou, L.-j., Zou, X.-r., Zhou, Y.-q., & Zhang, M. (2011). Age validation, relationship between age and otolith weight in Chilean jack mackerel (*Trachurus murphyi*) off Chile waters. *College of Marine Science, Shanghai Ocean University*.

Nekrasov, V. V. (1982). Distribución, biología y posibilidades de pesca del jurel (*Trachurus symmetricus murphyi*) en el Pacífico sureste. Informe interno del Instituto de Investigaciones Científicas Pesqueras y Oceanográficas de Rusia (VNIRO), 1–43. (in Russian).

Nekrasov, V. V. (1987). Métodos de evaluación de la dinámica del stock de generaciones, determinación de edad y ritmo de crecimiento del jurel peruano (*Trachurus symmetricus murphyi*). Informe Interno del Instituto de Investigaciones Pesqueras y Oceanográficas del Océano Pacífico de Vladivostok (TINRO), 44–46. (in Russian).

Nosov, E. V. (1989). Edad y ritmo de crecimiento. En recopilación: Biología y pesca del jurel peruano. Moscú, VNIRO, 3–65. (in Russian).

Panfili, J., de Pontual, H., Troadec, H., & Wright, P. J. (2002). Manual of fish sclerochronology (pp. 464-p+). Ifremer-IRD Coedition.

- Reeves S.A. 2003. A simulation study of the implications of age-reading errors for stock assessment and management advice. ICES Journal of Marine Science 60(2) 314-328. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S1054-3139\(03\)00011-0](https://doi.org/10.1016/S1054-3139(03)00011-0)
- Serra, R. (1991). Important life history aspects of the Chilean jack mackerel, *Trachurus symmetricus murphyi*. Investigaciones Pesqueras Chile, 36, 67–83.
- Shevchuk, C. L. V. (1982). Métodos de determinación de la edad del jurel (*Trachurus murphyi*) del Pacífico Suroriental. En Investigaciones pesqueras de las regiones abiertas del océano mundial. VNIRO, 97–105. (in Russian).
- SPRFMO. (2008). Chilean Jack mackerel workshop. Report of the South Pacific Fisheries Management Organisation (SPRFMO). Taller de Jurel Chileno, Santiago, Chile, 30 June - 4 July de 2008: 71 pp.
- SPRFMO. (2013). Report of the 1st Scientific Committee Meeting. La Jolla, EE. UU., 2013. <https://www.sprfmo.int/meetings/meeting-reports/>
- SPRFMO. (2022). 10th Scientific Committee Meeting Report. Wellington, Nueva Zelanda, 2022: 86 pp. <https://www.sprfmo.int/meetings/meeting-reports/>
- SPRFMO. (2023). 11th Scientific Committee meeting report. Wellington, New Zealand, 2023: 91 pp. <https://www.sprfmo.int/meetings/meeting-reports/>